Rethinking Responsibility in Development: Contested Relations between States, Citizens and Corporations 12.-13. February 2015

### PAPER ABSTRACTS

#### **WORKING GROUP 1**

### **CORPORATIONS AND COMMUNITIES**

Chairs: Dr. Dinah Rajak, Senior Lecturer, University of Sussex and Dr. Anja Nygren, Adjunct Professor in Development Studies, Research Collequim for Advanced Studies, University of Helsinki

Coordinator Liina-Maija Quist, Ph.D. Candidate, University of Helsinki/Development Studies (liina-maija.quist[at]helsinki.fi)

Today, the relations between corporations and communities are the object of careful strategic work performed by companies and communities, as well as by a variety of other actors such as states and NGOs. This working group invites you to explore the mechanisms (the 'whats') and processes (the 'hows') of corporations and communities meeting in the context of the former's operations. In other words, we are broadly interested in the discursive and political practices through which relations between corporations and communities are construed. Possible themes can revolve around shifting conceptualizations, politics, resource access and livelihoods that are connected to changing engagements between corporations and communities. The working group also invites contributions that examine the relationship between corporations and communities from the perspective of the politics of corporate social responsibility (CSR). We look forward to inspiring conversations and interesting theoretical and empirical insights into these issues.

# Corporate Social Responsibility in the Mexican oil industry. Tangible social responsibility initiatives Armando García Chiang

Professor, Department of Sociology, Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana-Iztapalapa, Mexico

Since the year 2012, a new type of contract has been bid on: "Petróleos Mexicanos (PEMEX) Integrated Contracts for Exploration and Production have led to the arrival of new actors in the Mexican oil market. In fulfillment of the requirements of the contracts, the new operators must apply 1% of their annual budget to social development, and they have to establish Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) plans which can be applied during the life of the contracts (25 to 30 years). These plans must contain proposals for concrete initiatives which could contribute to sustainable development in the territories where the oil companies operate.

In this context, a group of researchers of the Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Iztapalapa Unit (UAMI), developed a methodology for creating proposals of concrete social responsibility initiatives which seek to encourage the economic and social development of the population, which lives in 7 different

contractual areas (2 in the southern state of Tabasco, 3 in the state of Veracruz, another in Tamaulipas and the last one offshore, a fact which implies the creation of an area of influence).

This methodology includes the establishment of a social and economic baseline, the creation of a Corporate Social Responsibility Plan and, most importantly, a set of initiatives of concrete social responsibility actions adapted to the territory, in other words, territorial development actions that could come to be an alternative for sustainable local development.

This paper describes the aforementioned methodology.

# Resistance Strategies and their Outcomes in Indian Resource Politics: Evidence from Iron Mining Projects

Markus Kröger

Researcher, Docent in Development Studies, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Helsinki

The article summarizes the findings of extensive field research on the role of resistance movements in influencing corporate resource extraction across all major iron ore mining project areas in India. The data is pioneering in quality and the database the largest existing, with no logical remainders (unobserved cases), allowing for a systematic Qualitative Comparative Analysis. Since 2012, almost all of the mines in the West and South of India have been shut down, largely due to resistance efforts; this outcome is compared with the cases in the East where only a part of mines have been closed. The aim is to find out the necessary and sufficient causal condition complexes explaining the outcomes of different resistance strategies and conflict dynamics in natural resource politics.

#### Can CSR solve the gridlock? Contested discourses and contested relations

Ragnhild Madland

PhD student, International Management, Assistant Professor, Department of Global Development and Planning, University of Agder, Norway

All over the world mining companies face strong opposition from local communities residing within close vicinity of their operations. Many places the operations of mining companies have been stalled for years due to the resistance of local communities and civil society groups (Jenkins 2004). Mining companies formulate sophisticated Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) strategies as a response to the opposition, to obtain a social license to operate and to "pay back" to the communities for the negative impacts of their operations (Hutchins et al 2005). Does CSR have the potential to solve this gridlock?

Negotiation of agreements or the absence of such between companies and local communities represent a critical aspect of CSR. Several studies have emphasized the importance of building a partnership between companies and the societies in which they are embedded (). Deliberative approaches to CSR, reflecting a participatory approach based on negotiation, reciprocity and democratic contestation between companies and their stakeholders has been proposed to translate into a more realistic notion of CSR (Palazzo and Scherer 2006, 2012). However, these approaches have not addressed the central question of power (Banjeree 2007).

This study traces the discursive practices through which the complex relations between corporations and communities are construed through empirical research from Odisha, India, focusing on contested discourses over CSR and development. Applying the methodology of post-structuralist discourse theory, as developed by Laclau and Mouffe (1985), the research aspires to challenge accepted wisdom on CSR.

#### A Concentric CSR Roadmap Model for Host Community Relations in the Global South

Susanna Myllylä

University researcher, Dr.Adm.Sc., Department of History and Ethnology, University of Jyväskylä

This paper presents a concentric CSR model for corporate-community relationships. It is based on the case of Veracel Celulose and the Pataxó Indians in northeastern Brazil. Firstly, Veracel's production impacts on the Indigenous community were examined, and the company's CSR policy and its subsequent impact were brought under closer scrutiny by juxtaposing corporate words with corporate actions. Secondly, the community's own CSR expectations were studied. Thirdly, I found that it would be necessary to have a multidisciplinary approach; to build bridges between business ethics and development studies. The qualitative research material of the study consists of a Grounded Theory approach, ethnographic fieldwork data and the supporting extant literature.

The model has three circles: In the outer circle, legal or binding corporate responsibilities are described by 'in which frames' questions, while the middle circle of ethical responsibilities refers to 'how' something is done. In the inner circle, i.e. philanthropic responsibilities, it is basically a question of 'what' is done. Presenting the model as a hierarchical formation has several meanings, for example, the most urgent and binding issues have to be tackled first: in the glo¬bal South, land and its resources are particularly important for people's livelihoods. If the most crucial local needs are not first solved in the outer circles, actions at other levels may merely cover up sensitive issues in the community-corporation relationship.

This paper is based on an article published in March 2014, in EJBO Electronic Journal of Business Ethics and Organization Studies, Vol. 19, No. 1, pp. 27-51.

# Sustainable development and value sharing: A Co-operation between a German fragrance supplier and vanilla cultivators in Northeast Madagascar

Jenni Mölkänen

PhD Candidate, Social and Cultural Anthropology, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Helsinki

In Northeast Madagascar in the vicinity of the Marojejy National Park, Symrise, a German global supplier of fragrances, flavorings, cosmetic active ingredients and raw materials as well as functional ingredients, started to buy vanilla from local cultivators in 2012. The rhetoric that company used in public was concerned with environmental sustainability and securing "sharing the value throughout the production chain". The company was awarded with a German Sustainable Price in 2013 because of their work. However, the actual co-operation with the vanilla cultivators was encouraged by offering 1000 ariary better price/kg of green vanilla, reforestation programs, a possibility for a rice during "a hunger season" (the rice was, of course, supposed to be paid back during the next vanilla harvest season), giving an access to a hospital care and mobilizing prominent representatives in the villages whose task was to encourage cultivators to sell their vanilla to Symrise and not in the government regulated market. Local cultivators had diverse opinions about the company: some liked the company and their policy of a better price, some questioned why the company lent rice with a price higher than in the public market, some used company for their own efforts and Madagascar National Parks Office in Andapa related Symrise with conservation and development.

The paper argues that corporation-community –dichotomy is too simple to describe the reality of different relationships, company's access to vanilla requires constant negotiations, gifts and renewing the relationships. In the end, the claims and the statements represented in the case are also moral orientations.

### Of on-farm labour dynamics: Experiences of farm workers in a commercial farm in Western Kenya Katono Ouma

PhD candidate, Development Studies, Faculty of Social Sciences, University of Helsinki

In 2003, the government of Kenya leased out more than 7000 hectares of land in the western part of Kenya to a US-based company. The leased areas have since been converted into a large-scale agricultural farm that engages in rice production, and employs full-time employees and casual labourers from the local community.

This paper places labour at the center of the global land-grab debate by documenting the experiences of farm workers in the aforementioned farm. In doing so, its hopes to sharpen a few critical insights at the level of farm employment in the context of large-scale agricultural investment. It is often argued that the extent to which local communities can benefit from such investments is determined to a large extent by enterprise's employment intensity, particularly in cases where local communities have been forced into *de facto* proletarian statuses through being evicted or pushed off their land with the commission of the State. However, it is just as important to examine possible challenges and/or benefits through the modes in which such agricultural investments are managed by examining the labour relations that exist between farm workers and farm managers, and the political avenues through which these relationships are constructed. In this light, it would also be worthwhile to consider the ways in which farm workers engage in meaningful agency and how they consolidate and negotiate their positions in the sphere of work, where perhaps limited choices, opportunities and rights exist.

### State, private companies and citizens as media actors: The use of power and social sphere in Venezuelan society

Virpi Salojärvi

PhD candidate, Department of Social Research, University of Helsinki

According to Mouffe (2005) power, conflict and antagonism are the core concepts of democracy and political. It is also said that no matter what role the media has in a society it should be studied through power relations (Christians et al. 2009). In a media society these different actors of a democratic power play can be thought of as state and state media, market and private media, and civil society and alternative media.

In Venezuela during President Chavez's regime 1999–2013 the society polarized and a conflict between socialists and more liberal and individualistic ideas prevailed. One of the main stages of the conflict was media and the situation escalated to the point that it was called a media war. Media was seen to represent its owners and their political stance. In the research it is examined how different societal actors, that is the state, market, civil society and media, used power and social sphere in a Venezuelan polarized society.

The data consists of 34 interviews conducted in Venezuela in 2011–2012. The interviewees represent different media actors: from private, state and community media, and including also NGOs, academics, politicians and citizen activists. The interviews are analyzed by argument analysis.

Different media actors perceived the situation in different ways. Therefore, they had different manners to navigate in the society as well. Hegemony and responses to hegemony were in a key role.

#### **WORKING GROUP 2**

### CIVIL SOCIETY AND RESPONSIBILITIES RE-NEGOTIATED

Coordinator and Chair: Dr. Tiina Kontinen, Senior Lecturer, University of Jyväskylä (tiina.t.kontinen[at] jyu.fi)

Civil society provides a significant space for re-negotiation responsibilities in societies and at the global level. Associations, social movements, and activist networks provide a wide variety of opportunities to present claims and mobilise for change in regard to responsibility. Paralleling the renegotiation of responsibilities, the identities and roles of civil society itself are redefined. At the organizational level, there are increasing hybrids of organizational logic. For example, aspirations traditionally attached to civil society are articulated in the private sector, the private sector efficiency-imperative in turn enters civil society, and public policy-making then employs the practices of citizenship engagement. Moreover, trends such as "responsibilization" of individual citizens call for a redefinition of the roles and contributions of civil society. The working group invites both theoretical and empirical contributions that analyse the changing forms of civil society in general and specifically with regard to the re-negotiation of responsibilities.

### Assessing NGO-Government Relations in Bangladesh: Rhetoric or Reality

Mohammed Asaduzzaman

PhD, Professor, Department of Politics and Public Administration, Islamic University, Bangladesh

The role of NGOs in eradicating global poverty is highly recognized by the international development community during the last one decade and more. Bangladesh is known as one of the most fertile land for flourishing NGOs. The Grameen Bank (Bank of Poor) of Bangladesh has been awarded with the noble peace prize in 2006 for its outstanding performance in establishing world peace through reducing poverty and empowering women. However, despite its growing role in poverty alleviation a formal relation between the government and NGOs has not yet been established in Bangladesh. Rather, in some cases, the relation between these two parties has been politically motivated. The paper intends to examine the relations between the government and NGOs i.e. what has happened during the last 40 years in Bangladesh and how they have seen to each other? We argue that a formal and long-lasting institutional relationship between the government and NGOs is an inevitable in order to alleviate colossal poverty and reduce massive corruption in one hand and to provide better services to the poor people on the other hand in Bangladesh. The paper is divided into four sections. The significance of NGO-Government relations is described in the first section. The framework of NGO-Government relations is discussed in the second section. The growth and development of NGOs in Bangladesh is presented in the third section. The rhetoric and realities of NGO-Government relations in Bangladesh is discussed in the fourth section. Concluding remarks is presented in the final section of this paper. The findings of this paper are based on the secondary information.

#### Kanara Andolan: Movement for Land Rights

Samonova Elena Phd student, University of Helsinki

Debt bondage is one of the oldest forms of unfree labour. Today, there are about 27 million bonded labourers worldwide and about 15 million of them live in South Asia (India, Asia and Pakistan). One of the most widespread systems of bonded labour in Nepal is the so-called Kamaiya system. This system can be described with 3 Ls: Land, Loans and Labour. Due to landlessness, lack of alternative income and social exclusion, the members of the Tharu ethnic group are forced to take loans from the landlords in order to survive and then they have to pay their debt through long-term servitude with limited compensation. Due to the low remuneration they receive for their work and the absence of opportunities to earn additional income, the Kamaiya are often unable to pay off their debts and therefore their servitude becomes lifelong. This paper focuses on Kanara Andolan – social movement of Kamaiya bonded labourers who claimed their rights over land, which they believed they were entitled to. This movement took place in the 1990th. The aim of the paper is to show how this movement challenged power structures and roles division in the society and contributed to the construction of the civil society in Nepal.

This paper is a part of the dissertation project about the power transformation in favour of bonded labourers in Nepal and India and the role of human rights approaches in such transformation.

### *Identities and responsibilities of Hungarian civil organisations in rural development*Varga Eszter

According to the bottom-up development paradigm civil organisations play an important role in developing rural areas. With their innovative ideas and cooperation they can be one of the key players in the development process. The paper highlights the main conflicting points about the identities, roles and responsibilities of the examined Hungarian civil organisations: what they think about themselves, what others (the society, the government, etc.) expect from them and what they actually do in their daily operation.

### Strengthening the Southern Civil Society through Capacity Building? A case study from Liberia Anja Onali

PhD candidate, University of Helsinki

Liberia is a Western African country that has been torn by civil wars and lately the Ebola epidemic has put an end to the incipient development processes. For survival and support people turn to churches, to secret societies, chiefs and tribal associations, and to other local forms of social security. However, when the aid system talks about strengthening the civil society it usually refers to non-governmental organizations (NGO). In 2004 UNDP announced that it will provide capacity building in order to strengthen the local civil society and hundreds of NGOs were registered. Both NGOs and capacity building efforts have mushroomed ever since. Based on a case study from current day Liberia, this study explores the aims and forms of capacity building provided by the aid system and the capabilities that are being promoted both intentionally and un-intentionally. The empirical information has been gathered during three field trips to Liberia in 2012-13 and it is based on interviews, civil society events, workshops and discussions with different actors as well as locally gathered documentation.

#### Learning in development? A Case Study of Volunteer Tourism in Zambia

Oona Timonen, MSocSc, and Tiina Kontinen, PhD University of Jyväskylä

Voluntarism and volunteering have traditionally occupied a central role in the activities in civil society development organizations. Overseas volunteers have been perceived as important facilitators of local development, and realizing the spirit of global solidarity by providing their skills and knowledge to be used by Southern civil society organizations and communities. Recently, overseas volunteerism has increasingly been labelled as volunteer tourism characterized by short-term commitment. In the tourism industry, it is seen as a form of sustainable tourism that has the possibility to promote intercultural learning and solidarity in developing countries through an encounter of the local hosts and foreign guests. In recent years, a lot of critical voices have challenged this presumption. In this paper, we problematize the notion of learning related to the volunteer tourism, and suggest different manifestations of learning, and non-learning, at individual, organizational, and institutional level. Through a detailed analysis of a case study in a Zambian children's home that receives temporal volunteers from overseas on a regular basis, we especially focus on the learning dynamics within encounters between the receiving organization and the individual volunteers. The findings show how these encounters enable specific kinds of individual and organizational learning, but, simultaneously, manifest institutional non-learning.

#### **WORKING GROUP 3**

### RESPONSIVE AND DELIBERATIVE ENVIRONMENTAL GOVERNANCE

Chairs: Dr. Bernadeta Killian, Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, University of Dar es Salaam and Dr. Kaisa Matschoss, Senior Researcher, National Consumer Research Centre, University of Helsinki

Coordinator Dr. Irmeli Mustalahti, Academy Research Fellow, LYY Institute, University of Eastern Finland (irmeli.mustalahti[at]uef.fi)

The responsive and deliberative approach in various environmental governance actions and interventions aims to empower local citizens to influence the development of their immediate surroundings. This approach argues for development and social change that is primarily driven by the local population interacting with the authorities or other relevant actors. The goal of responsive environmental governance is to include as many actors and differing visions as possible in local and regional environmental management and conservation. In this approach, citizens are seen to influence society via voting and other civic actions, but also as consumers who can influence their environment through their choice of commercial products and services. The concept of the citizen-consumer is increasingly used by scholars in an attempt to establish a wider understanding of what has been termed green, ecological, sustainable or responsible consumption.

In this working group, we aim to discuss the possibilities and constraints of these types of approaches in environmental governance: what are some cases in which the deliberation over rights and responsibilities in environmental governance take place? And how/under what circumstances do various actors in the exercise of public authority and responsive governance emerge? We also welcome discussions on the role of citizen-consumers in the context of responsive governance and how this might strengthen or weaken local environmental governance. This working group seeks to bring together research that addresses the issues of responsive and deliberative governance of natural resource management and conservation, and studying environmental conflicts and various environmental planning interventions. We also encourage contributions that address the choices of consumer-citizens and how these relate to developing countries.

#### Delinking legitimacies – a pluriversal perspective on deliberation

Maria Ehrnström-Fuentes Hanken School of Economics

In recent years deliberation has been increasingly promoted as a means for producing legitimate decisions in a wide variety of public and private governance schemes. It is said to augment stakeholders' influence over decisions and reduce conflicts with these stakeholders. This study challenges that

assumption by examining the role of dialogue as a means for local community stakeholders to have their claims included in the final outcome of the deliberation. Based on a comparative case study of two different local stakeholder groups involved in protracted conflict over a pulp mill in the south of Chile, the study finds asks: 1) why did the two stakeholder groups chose different participation strategies in the EIA process?, and (2) how can insights from this particular case contribute to the broader understanding of how corporate legitimacy is restored through stakeholder dialogues? Based on an analysis of documented material and interviews with key actors, I find that what was perceived as morally legitimate in each location also depended on the social imaginaries in each location and the community's degree of dependence on (or autonomy from) external markets for their subsistence. These factors played a crucial role in how the stakeholder groups positioned themselves in terms of participating or not in the EIA process and how the legitimacy of the company was perceived in the community. To restore corporate legitimacy, the study suggest a shift in how legitimacy is perceived, from universal to a pluriversal locally embedded legitimacy, where dialogue between stakeholders instead of focusing an abstract consensus, focus on how to re-structure corporate activities so that they support the production, reproduction and development of all human life, regardless of the social imaginary where these activities are embedded.

### Symbolic democracy as social safeguard in REDD+: The case of the UN-REDD Programme in Nigeria Emmanuel Nuesiri

University of Illinois Urbana Champaign, USA

The reducing emissions from deforestation and forest degradation plus the sustainable management of forest and enhancement of carbon stocks (REDD+) is a proposed global climate change mitigation initiative that could lead to the largest enclosure of public forests, with negative impact on livelihood of forest dependent people. The United Nations REDD Programme (UN-REDD) is working with governments in developing countries to build up their capacity in implementing REDD+ if and when it becomes part of a new global climate change mitigation treaty. In recognition of REDD+ probable negative impacts on local livelihood, the UN-REDD has developed a rigorous set of environmental and social safeguards. Included among the social safeguards is the promotion of strong local democracy as a measure against elite capture of REDD+ benefits. In Nigeria, the UN-REDD favor a participatory approach in the Nigeria-REDD programme implementation based on the conviction that this strengthens local democratic practices. A study of the design phase of the Nigeria-REDD was carried out using literature review, participant observation, and field interviews of 125 research participants. The study found that the UN-REDD participatory approach fails to capture and address severe democratic governance deficits at the local level in Nigeria. In spite of this shortcoming the Nigeria-REDD was approved by the UN-REDD policy board and its now in its operational phase. The sociology of international organizations (IOs) theory explains this gap between rhetoric and practice as resulting from IOs mandate to refrain from challenging the sovereignty of their member states, and from IOs technocratic bureaucratic culture. However, critical environmental theory also show that government institutions in order to gain public acceptance while not offending powerful benefactors, formulate symbolic environmental policies that creates a perception of providing solutions to environmental problems without substantively addressing the problems. This paper shows that the UN-REDD is engaging in symbolic democratic action in Nigeria, to gain public acceptance for REDD+, while not alienating its benefactors, which in this case are the UN-REDD donors and member states.

#### REDD+ in Indonesia: Problems of equivalence in the localities

Anu Lounela University of Helsinki

REDD+ (Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation) schemes draw their authority and funds from extra-state sources. They carry with them Payment for Ecosystem Services (PES) or other carbon trading schemes and trials that aim to contribute to the post-Kyoto treaty. REDD+ is global and local at the same time. At the local level REDD+ projects include calculation, monitoring, education, evaluation and forming of new institutions; nature and its management are given values that are calculated by money and local populations are "trained" to manage project procedures and carbon trading schemes. Indonesia has plenty of REDD+ pilot projects that operate in the localities, where they receive different responses from the local populations. This paper explores how REDD+ schemes interact with local populations in Kalimantan, and what kind of tensions or collaborations there emerge. It will specifically focus on questions of exchange, equivalence and different value orientations that are revealed in the interactions of the parties that take part in the result-based environmental projects implemented in the localities.

#### Social capital in small-scale forestry: a local case study in Southern Sweden

Ida Wallin, Luis-Andrés Guillén and Vilis Brukas Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences

Small-scale forestry builds upon interactions among local stakeholders. Forest management include multiple social situations such as consultations or cooperative engagements between owners and forest professionals. Successful social endeavours rest on positive social capital as operationalized via trust. Based on qualitative in-depth interviews with forest owners, managers and other forestry stakeholders, this study explores how trust influences the social relationships in a local context of Southern Swedish forestry. Most strikingly, the analysis reveals large differences in owners' trust towards two major actors: the Swedish Forest Agency (SFA) and the forest owner association (FOA) Södra. Permanence of personnel, a client-based approach, and personal features of SFA's local forest officer lead to strong local anchoring and high trust towards SFA. Södra proved to be a trustful partner in the aftermath of calamities; however its industrial priorities seem to erode owners' trust. The empirical findings of this study demonstrate the importance of recognizing personal relationships and the catalysing role of bonding social capital in order to understand the local forest management situations. Our results are useful for forestry organisations and policy-makers aiming to comprehend the local context and implement best practices in small-scale forestry.

#### Population Dynamics and Livelihood Change on Ukara Island, Lake Victoria

Tomi Lounio University of Helsinki

This study is about the relation between population dynamics and livelihood change in the Kara farming system on Ukara Island, Tanzania. The population densities on Ukara have been exceptionally high since the 18th century, which has been made possible by a complex set of soil conserving measures utilised by the local Kara farmers. The research is based on a 5-week ethnographic fieldwork on Ukara Island in early 2013. The findings show that the local households have been troubled with insufficient amounts of cultivable land for decades, and out-migration has acted as a safety valve in controlling population pressure on land. This has culminated in the voluntary and forced re-settlements of local farmers to the mainland in year 1974 as part of the Ujamaa villagisation programme by the socialist government. Nonetheless, there has been a steady growth in population densities since the re-settlements. The wide-scale adoption of tuber crops instead of traditional cereals has allowed the local farmers to produce more

calories per hectare than before. The crop choice and reductions in fallow periods seem to be the only major modifications in the local cultivation patterns, and no advanced technologies or inputs are used. More recently, the rapid development of the commercial fishery on Lake Victoria has absorbed surplus male labour from the local farming households and allowed for further diversification of livelihood income portfolios. The open-access fishery is prone to over-fishing, however, and especially the Nile perch stock is not providing enough catch for most fishing crews without the use of illegal methods.

# Bio-economy as the new face of sustainable development: reshaping forest discourses and local governance?

Alexandru Giurca Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences

Irmeli Mustalahti and Sabaheta Ramcilovic-Suominen University of Eastern Finland

Current discussions around bio-economy neglect social considerations and omit global governance and participation discourses. Local actors' (landowners, forest users and forest-dependent communities) perspectives are absent in the European and international bio-economy discussion at this point. There is an obvious need to first understand the main objectives and characteristics of this emerging concept, as well as to broaden and further develop the concept in order to give local actors a more prominent role. By scrutinizing the bio-economy discussions, from both European and international perspective, we aim to understand how the new "meta-discourse" on bio-economy is influencing other forest-discourses. The assumption is that if this new discourse on bio-economy is undermining other important discourses (sustainability, climate change and illegal logging) it risks to discourage fragile coalitions and initiatives (certification schemes, climate change programs, legality programs) that these previous discourses have helped build. There are key governance-related challenges – such as responsive governance, lack of participation, social safeguards - at national/local levels, that need to be addressed. With this paper, we aim to stimulate discussion on the potentials and pitfalls of the existing responsive governance frameworks in relation to bio-economy.

# Foreign donors driving policy change in recipient countries: Three decades of development aid influencing forest policy in Bangladesh

Md Saifur Rahman, Md. Nazmus Sadath and Lukas Giessen University of Göttingen, Germany

The role and influence of non-domestic and international actors on domestic policy change is a major question in political and development policy studies. This article analyses the influence of donor aid for development projects on domestic policy change, particularly on community-based forest development policy in Bangladesh. In our analytical framework we combine concepts from development policy analysis, the international relations theorem of direct access, and the multiple streams approach to policy change analysis. We build on existing own longitudinal findings on forest policy changes in Bangladesh and contrast them with 1980-2014 data on forest development project aid. In a first step we identify multiple links between the two parallel streams suggesting that donors' aid has an impact on domestic policy changes. In a second step we substantiate selected links through qualitative in-depth studies. The results suggest a link between donor funding and domestic policy changes. These links are further specified based on their temporal relation, i.e., policy changes are observed occurring prior to, in response to, or simultaneously with donor funding. We conclude that the observed links between donor funding for forestry projects influencing forest policy change are substantially demonstrated and that our findings even underrepresent the entire range of such funding on other sectorial policies and of funding in other sectors on forest policy.

### RETHINKING RESPONSIBILITY IN GLOBAL GOVERNANCE

Chair: Professor Barry Gills, University of Helsinki/Development Studies

Coordinator: Dr. Marikki Stocchetti, Visiting Research Fellow in Development Studies, University of Helsinki and Secretary General of the Finnish Development Policy Committee (marikki.stocchetti [at] formin.fi)

This working group is concerned with the different aspects of responsibility in global governance. Global governance refers here to collective action to address the causes and consequences of adverse supranational, transnational, or national problems related to sustainable development. In particular, we are interested in the role and contribution of different actors (citizens, governments both in the global South/North and international organisations) in the understanding, framing and tackling of global problems. Relatedly, the question of responsibility in this context may refer to normative responsibility, which includes the moral and legal aspects of responsibility. 'Responsibility' may also include political accountability, legitimacy as well as assessments of responses. While we invite contributions that focus on responsibility and governance at different cross-cutting levels, the thematic scope of the papers may touch upon the different dimensions of sustainable development (economic, social, environmental and security). In particular, we welcome academic papers that deal with the post-2015 UN sustainable development agenda process and universal development goals, which are founded on reframed conceptualisations of responsibility.

# On the Human Rights Framework as a Forum for Accountability within Development Cooperation Maija Mustaniemi-Laakso Institute for Human Rights, Åbo Akademi University

Development policies and their implementation can go distressingly wrong. As the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights has acknowledged, 'many activities undertaken in the name of 'development' have subsequently been recognised as ill-conceived and even counter-productive in human rights terms'. Lately, this composition has been more and more called into question and increasing demands are being made for greater accountability within development cooperation, especially accountability based on human rights. Several different perspectives have emerged as regards the systematic linkage of the human rights framework and the development discourse, differing slightly in their emphasis and detail but all advocating a human rights-based approach to development (HRBAD). As the starting point of the human rights-based agenda is in human rights understood as legally enforceable entitlements, its aim is set at identifying the actual duty-holders, striving to raise the levels of accountability of those responsible for realising the rights of the individual. While this primarily is perceived to imply the accountability of the domestic states for the realisation of human rights within their territories, it is increasingly acknowledged that human rights give rise to what lately have become known as extraterritorial obligations (ETOs), i.e. human rights obligations that a state owes to individuals beyond its borders. However, while accountability figures predominantly as one of the basic premises of the HRBADs in policy documents dealing with development since the early 2000s, the meaning of human rights accountability in development cooperation relationships still remains notoriously unclear. What is it actually that we mean when we speak of accountability, more specifically about human rights

accountability, within development cooperation? Essentially, how does human rights accountability accommodate extraterritorial concerns typical to the development context in a vertical relationship between the state and a forum constituted of individuals beyond the territorial jurisdiction of the state?

### Multistakeholder Governance on Sustainable Palm Oil through the Lens of Agonistic Pluralism Martin Fougère

Associate Professor in Politics and Business Hanken School of Economics, Helsinki, Finland

Recent influential works on Corporate Social Responsibility / CSR have noted that as a result of globalization-induced governance gaps and societal pressure for companies to act in a more responsible manner, many firms have started contributing to the production of public goods and taking on some of the traditional responsibilities of governments. In particular, in Scherer and Palazzo's (2007) theorization of 'political CSR', the empirical phenomenon most in focus is the proliferation of multistakeholder governance arrangements involving a variety of business actors from the industries affected by this 'governance', civil society organizations with a stake in this governance and sometimes state-related actors. Habermasian deliberative democracy is used as a lens to not only frame this empirical phenomenon, but also legitimize these arrangements as improvements to transnational governance. A variety of critiques of Scherer and Palazzo's political CSR have been articulated, in relation to both their empirical arguments (globalization is claimed to lead to governance gaps, hence the argued need for politicization of business) and their theoretical arguments (deliberative democracy is argued to be a good lens to study this phenomenon both descriptively and normatively). In this paper, I propose to draw on Mouffe's (2005[1993]; 1999; 2000; 2005; 2013) works on agonistic pluralism to problematize the notion that multistakeholder governance arrangements bring more democratic control on corporate power.

In order to illustrate this argument, I discuss issues related to the transnational governance on 'sustainable palm oil', with a particular focus on: (1) the Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO), a multistakeholder arrangement that involves business and civil society actors and relies on a certification scheme to promote the growth of sustainable palm oil production; and (2) civil society organizations seeking to address palm oil sustainability by focusing on the outcomes of governance in terms of limiting deforestation and other negative externalities of palm oil production. In line with Laclau and Mouffe (1985), I examine these different approaches to the problem of palm oil sustainability as hegemonic practices, that is, as (hegemonic and counterhegemonic) 'attempts to articulate discourses which can bring about a moral, intellectual and political leadership' (Torfing 1999).

### Carbon Accounting and Accountability: The Effects of Clean Development Mechanism in Cambodia Mira Käkönen

PhD Candidate, Department of Political and Economic Studies/Development Studies, University of Helsinki

This paper looks at the different social and ecological dynamics at play in Cambodia in the production of offsets for carbon markets of Clean Development Mechanism (CDM). CDM is an important case of neoliberal forms of global environmental governance. It also exemplifies relevant North-South dynamics and its core justification rests on the principle of common but differentiated responsibilities vis-à-vis climate change mitigation. Cambodia is a relevant case country as it has been a leading country among the so called 'Least Developed Countries' (LDCs) in gaining CDM projects. The paper reveals several shortcomings and adverse outcomes of the CDM projects and explores how and to what extent they can be understood in relation to the very logic of the market mechanism CDM is built upon as well as in relation to the practices related to carbon accounting. The accounted carbon units create commensurability and equivalences for example between small-scale rural renewable energy projects and large hydropower dams. At the same time many aspects of the on-the-ground realities are rendered invisible. In Cambodia 4 out of 10 CDM projects are large-scale hydropower dams. With the global gaze

fixed on emission units, the CDM element in dam projects seem to divert attention away from the adverse local effects analysed in the paper. The Cambodian CDM cases investigated raise the question that those who are doing the accounting of carbon such as the UNFCCC officials, Northern experts and consultants involved in monitoring, reporting and verification are not being held to account for the failures related to the CDM. The research material consists of policy and project documents, key informant interviews as well as community-level fieldwork.

# Africans' Conceptions for Africa's Future Development: Constructing Agencies of Excluded for Inclusion through Postcolonial Theory

Heidi Alatalo

PhD Candidate, University of Lapland

This study is interested in Africans' notions about Africa's development and their response to the current development debate. The study examines African intellectuals and civil activists in order to determine what kinds of agencies these two different groups are trying to construct in the context of development. Although the current development discourses rely largely on Eurocentric development thinking, especially China's different development approach in Africa challenges the current development knowledge as well as practices. Therefore, the another research question deals with power relations by asking what kinds of relations these groups are constructing for Africa regarding the Western countries as well as for China from the standpoint of agency. In this study, post-colonial theory is used as a critical tool which draws attention of how development knowledge and power relations are constructed within development practices. Development is more as a transforming concept than stable one, influenced by international politics and different kinds of interests involved in it. Thus, responsibility as a concept is vital when considering global governance related to agency in the context of development. Agency is always connected to power. It is also related to rights, responsibilities and expectations, even resistance of state of affairs. Instead of seeing Africa's people merely as objects of other actors development policies governed by outside, this study regards them as subjects, who actively envision and produce alternative future(s) for Africa. Thus, we also should take into consideration whether/or by what means global governance is able to response to the issue of responsibility of (African) development.

# Changing perceptions about women and their relation with development: Women's issues in Finnish and Polish Development Cooperation Systems

Joanna Bunikowska

Department of Social Sciences University of Eastern Finland

The aim of this paper is to present the general idea of the doctoral research I am currently conducting. In my research I attempt at answering questions: why do "we" help women in developing countries (through development cooperation) and how we (should) help them. In order to investigate this problem I analyze two models: Finnish and Polish development cooperation systems. I explore how women's issues have been understood and addressed accordingly by Finland and Poland in their development cooperation policies and practices. My goal is also to identify different perceptions about women in development context in both models. I am looking at Finland because this country is committed both nationally and internationally to gender equality, and is considered to be a pioneer in this matter. On the other hand, I am looking at Poland-country that relied itself on aid support in order to undergo economic and political transformation and now it becomes a donor of aid itself. This past experience influences and shapes Polish present development agenda in many ways. Both countries significantly support women's issues in their development cooperation practices. Women's issues entered the development discourse and practice in the 1970s. They have been approached from various perspectives. Notions of how to consider and address women's issues in development context have changed very often since. Today, women's issues are again at the centre of the development (cooperation) discourse.

#### The European Union and Middle Income Countries: Insights on the New Relationship

Riina Pilke

PhD Candidate, Department of Economic Sociology, University of Turku

This paper focusses on analysing the European Union's changing relationship with the new Middle Income Countries (MICs). The European Commission has changed its modus operandi in certain countries in the Multiannual Financial Framework 2014-2020, and this paper assesses the conditions that led to the decision to pronounce graduation from development cooperation to other types of partnerships. The analysis concerns 19 MICs, where the Commission initially decided to end development cooperation. The countries represent a broad spectrum of MICs, thus challenging the EU, in the transition from development cooperation to other types of partnerships, to revisit the existing, principally donor-driven country classifications. At the centre of the analysis are the Union's perceptions on policy coherence for development vis-à-vis increasing economic interest outside the Union, largely deriving from decreased competitiveness of the Eurozone. I argue that the EU has taken a narrow stance on policy coherence for development, which is manifested in its institutional operations mainly through concerns on the compliance between the partner country rules and the European trade and agricultural policies. Development apprehensions, despite centring the debate on the EU's differentiated cooperation in the MICs, are not embedded in the Union's actions for enhanced policy coherence. Moreover, the EU's previous strategic objectives in most of the concerned MICs included human development and specifically reduction of inequalities, but the lack of effective means to address these issues have led to doubts on the effectiveness of the cooperation, which has further urged the decision to alter partnerships priorities in these countries.

# A Perfect Post-2015 Partner? Analyzing the EU's Development and Trade Agendas for Global Development Partnership

Marikki Stocchetti

PhD, Visiting Researcher Department of Political and Economic Studies/Development Studies, University of Helsinki

This article discusses the EU's commitment to the achievement of international development goals from a policy coherence perspective. In particular, it looks at the ways in which the Union has contributed to the targets of global partnership for development (MDG-8) with its development and trade policies. The article analyses the EU's initiatives related to development financing, to international trade in the WTO and its own trade arrangements. While taking stock of the implementation of the current MDG-8 and its targets, it also discusses possibilities to enhance universal approach to poverty eradication and sustainable development. Relatedly, the article also reviews the prospects for the EU's role in the post-2015 period. The article argues that the EU's implementation of MDG-8 have been insufficient and uneven. It also shows how the PCD-approach can be used to improve both the EU's policy coherence and global partnership for development.

#### Does The WTO Have A Future? Some Responses From the Trade Policy Community

Silke Trommer

Lecturer in Global Sustainable Development and World Politics, Department of Political Science, University of Helsinki & Ann Capling, Professor, Murdoch University, Perth, Australia

There is a rich scholarly literature that diagnoses the problems of the WTO and advocates reforms. By contrast, much less is known about the views of trade policy makers themselves and their understandings of the role of the WTO, its problems, and preferred solutions. This paper presents the preliminary results

from a research project that investigates the views of trade policy communities in several major WTO members and what they tell us about the likely shape of the global trade system to come. We found a strong consensus on the need for a multilateral institution to negotiate the rules for global trade and shared views about the major causes for the failure of the Doha Round to be concluded. The majority of our interviewees agreed that the WTO is here to stay in the long run but that 'not much will happen' in the near to medium term future. Most interviewees see the conflicts underlying global trade politics today as rooted in the international economy's shifting power relations and the historical evolution of the multilateral trade system. For this reason, we suggest that technical fixes such as reform of decision-making processes are unlikely to resolve its problems.

# Corporate Governance and the Financial Crisis: The New Paradigm of the Rule of Law after the Collapse

Dawid Bunikowski, Doctor of Laws, Postdoctoral Researcher, University of Eastern Finland, Law School & Distinguished Academic Associate, Centre for Law and Religion, Cardiff University

This paper is to explain the concept of corporate governance and its principles. I consider how deviant practice appeared both prior to and during the financial crisis which began in 2007. The paper also aims to highlight the difference between the institutional axiology (written codes used within companies, the state law) and the real axiology (deviance on the part of companies, breaking promises) in companies. My opinion is that the crisis in corporate governance and business ethics was one of the main factors behind the financial crisis (so it is an axiological crisis). Sadly, axiology that should have been really expressed in ethics in business was forgotten or depreciated. Paradoxically, the financial crisis also brought about changes in the classical rule of law paradigm. Finally, I think that states are now willing to take all available extraordinary (sometimes constitutionally doubtful) measures to curb violations of law by companies, to safeguard good corporate governance and to protect human freedom and rights. Thus the rule of law paradigm is changed, also for some other reasons (mentioned in my conclusions).

### EPISTEMIC AND METHODOLOGICAL RESPONSIBILITY

Coordinators: Emily Höckert, Ph.D. Candidate, University of Lapland/Tourism Studies (emily.hockert[at]helsinki.fi) and Eija Ranta (eija.ranta[at]helsinki.fi), Postdoctoral researcher, Development Studies, University of Helsinki

Rather than merely exploring the responsibility or ethics of development per se, this thematic session focuses on the responsibilities linked to the production of knowledge within development studies and practices. That is, instead of highlighting what we know, the emphasis here is on how we know it. While epistemology can be understood as the relations between the knower and the known, methodology provides an approach which guides the practices of collecting and analysing empirical data and weaving together the outcomes into more complete/inclusive constructions of knowledge. The search for responsible epistemologies and methodologies requires a heightened sense of self-reflexivity about our positioning as researchers and about the context in which research is planned and conducted. What is more, responsible epistemologies and methodologies encourage open discussion about the purposes of our studies, but also about the ethical and political implications of research on those directly or indirectly involved in it.

For this session, we look forward to receiving papers which address the issues of epistemologies and methodologies. Possible themes include, but are not limited to, the processes of decolonizing epistemologies, discussion and disruption of unequal power relations in fieldwork settings, and responsibilities and ethics of representation – of speaking for, and speaking about the Other. While hoping for a frank discussion about the ethical challenges we face as students, researchers and development practitioners, we wish to encourage participants of this session to envision possibilities for opening up new spaces for alternative ways of knowing to thrive.

### Words, Tools and Privilege. Knowledge Construction, the White Political Field and Decolonization.

Julia Suárez-Krabbe

Assistant professor, Department of Culture and Identity, Roskilde University, Denmark

This paper presents central aspects in the processes of decolonizing methodologies. It is divided into three parts: firstly, it describes how methods largely work to legitimize themes, research foci, and the disciplines themselves. This is decadent, and protects the white political field. The second part addressed the close relationship between academic expertise, the white political field and the colonial politics of being: methods also imply that the scholars produce ourselves in a specific way – as experts – and this process entails identification with whiteness and the simultaneous invisibilization of the violences at the core of these processes of identification. Finally, the paper presents the core elements in the "Charter of Decolonial Research Ethics", a charter that grew from my work with social movements in Europe as a way to address these movements' need to provide clear guidelines for researchers, who were interested in researching them. This charter is useful to think through decolonizing methodologies because it addresses – and seeks to disrupt – several core privileges which are naturalized in academic research.

#### Epistemic Hospitality: Envisioning Ethics in Ethnographic Research

**Emily Höckert** 

Doctoral candidate, Multidimensional Tourism Institute MTI, University of Lapland, Finland

The general aim of this conceptual paper is to contribute in the search for more responsible encounters in ethnographic research by bringing together postcolonial and phenomenological discussions on ethical subjectivity. It is guided by Gayatri Spivak's thought of how decolonizing power relations, in both academic research and development encounters, require constant reflection on how one's preassumptions and bias might lead to epistemic ignorance: to neglecting other ways of knowing the world. The scientific purpose of the study is not only to deconstruct, but also to envision alternatives to ethnographic research encounters through the notion of hospitality. The theoretical approach builds on Emmanuel Levinas' and Jacques Derrida's discussions on ethics of hospitality, which invites us to think about the possibility of unconditional, open, infinite welcome. For these scholars, ethical subjectivity is not freedom, but openness and receptivity towards the other. Situating the idea of producing knowledge at the intersection between intersubjectivity, hospitality and ethics, the paper ask, in which ways the thought of unconditional welcome might differ from the current approaches on ethnographic research. As a result, the study proposes how moving towards more ethical encounters call for readiness to interrupt self and moving beyond the 'I' as an ethical and responsible subject. The ways this paper addresses the issue of epistemic ignorance, could be further used for developing research methodologies that open doors for the unexpected.

#### Toward an Ethnography of Decolonial Government

Eija Ranta

Postdoctoral researcher, Development Studies, University of Helsinki, Finland

This paper is developing a methodological argument according to which a qualitative ethnographic approach may help to "decolonize" the scholarly examination of state formation and global processes by bringing to the fore unexpected local political alternatives that often reside outside Western scholarly and ideological paradigms; an issue to which I refer as an 'ethnography of decolonial government'. Academic knowledge production and expertise is part of global power relations that may - or may not - create, maintain, and deepen hierarchies and inequalities between the Global South and its northern counterpart. Combining the long critical tradition of anthropological critique to the need to follow indigenous peoples to such political arenas that have most commonly been examined theoretically and in an abstract manner rather than ethnographically, my claim is that ethnographic knowledge production has the potential of "decolonizing" the study of policy-making and state formation processes in two ways. First of all, as ethnography is usually based on long-term fieldwork among the people whom the researcher is examining, the point of departure is their lived realities and the local meanings that they attach to their own surroundings - often at the expense of the researcher's own preconceptions, theoretical interests and Western scholarly paradigms. Secondly, an ethnographic approach makes the researcher's own positionality visible through reflexivity; it illuminates the possible impacts of such issues as gender, class, ethnicity, or political views on data collection, methodological and theoretical choices, and the paradigms employed in analysis. The empirical case to illuminate my methodological concerns comes from contemporary Bolivia in which indigenous peoples have become creators of alternative state policy ideas.

### Spaces of dialogue? The case of the World Social Forum Tunis 2013 from the perspective of young, local volunteers

Fatma Jabberi and Sofia Laine Finnish Youth Research Network

In this article, we study empirically, using a multidimensional approach, the concepts of dialogue and contact zone in the setting of the World Social Forum (WSF) Tunis 2013 with a special emphasis on the young, local volunteers. Although the young Tunisians played a crucial role in the revolution, they have been side-lined in the construction of the country's new democracy. Moreover, many of the WSF volunteers, i.e. the backbone of the forum, are young locals. This article presents a combination of Jabberi's autoethnographic work and Laine's ethnographic work in the WSF Tunis 2013.

Our interest in studying the diversity of dialogues involving young, local Tunisians during the WSF points towards our motivation to understand how the different groups and actors in the WSF develop contacts with each other. Following Sara Ahmed's (2000) idea of knowledge production, our aim in this article is to trace 'the relations of knowledge that allow the stranger to enter the community [...] with the "who" that knows'. The article touches upon three different kinds of 'communities' where the authors' positions also vary: Tunisia's civil society (Sofia as a stranger, Fatma as the 'who' that knows), the WSF (everyone as a stranger) and academic journal publishing (Fatma as a stranger, Sofia as the 'who' that knows). Furthermore, the WSF functions as a contact zone that enabled an encounter between the two authors to start the process of translating their knowledge and practices (of Tunisian civil society and of academic publishing) to each other.

#### **Empowerment Narratives**

Sara Robinson-Moncada Doctoral candidate, University of Jyväskylä, Finland

As non-governmental organizations (NGOs) take on more significance within international development cooperation, pressures also increase to provide concrete evidence of the results of development interventions. Many of the existing tools for monitoring and evaluation rely on measurable indicators that inadequately describe many value-based objectives, such as empowerment. Recently, narratives and life change stories are being considered as increasingly effective ways of gathering data on these value-based objectives. Still even as NGOs collect narratives, their methods of and time for analysis of them have not increased, nor have many donors' pressures for evidence-based results varied greatly. This research studies the concept of community and individual empowerment from an organizational perspective based on interviews with staff from a Finnish development NGO and four of its global partners. Using narrative analysis to explore empowerment and non-empowerment narratives given in individual interviews, this study attempts to understand different dimensions of empowerment in international development and shed light on both organizational theories of change in empowerment processes and methodologies for understanding empowerment narratives. In an attempt to contribute to dialogues of knowledge production by whom, for whom and how, the analysis intends to search for typologies of empowerment narratives and structural characteristics in order to conceptualize organizational understandings of empowering processes.

# Ecological community knowledge in catchment management studies – hybrid knowledge production among the Taita people in Kenya

Johanna Hohenthal, Paola Minoia, Belinda Andersson and Petri Pellikka Department of Geosciences and Geography, University of Helsinki, Finland

Integration of local ecological knowledge into environmental resource management is supported by many nations, international organizations and current resource management approaches. Community involvement has also become important in many developing countries as responsibilities to manage renewable environmental resources have been transferred to local communities as part of emerging comanagement regimes. In practice, the involvement of the local residents and their knowledges into environmental management is rarely adequate. Attitudes of the institutions and the long history of dominance of the Western scientific practices and epistemological perceptions act as constraints.

This study explores community participation and the characteristics of ecological community knowledge (ECK) in Taita Hills, South-East Kenya. An ethnographic research was conducted whereby interviews, participatory mapping, historical timelines, focus group discussions and participant observation were employed to gather ECK of water resources and related ecosystems. The study reveals the hybrid nature of ECK, which draws from personal experiential knowledge, traditional knowledge and 'official' science provided by formal education, media and administrative institutions. This challenges the traditional binary opposition between local and 'Western' knowledges. The study also explores the twofold relation of the Taita people to their traditional knowledge. Moreover, the study identifies challenges in integrating ECK into water resource management, which stem from inadequate community participation affected by unequal power relations between the management authorities and the community as well as within the community. Failures to understand the societal context in which the hybrid knowledges are constructed may also lead to judging ECK as unsustainable and unsuitable for resource management.

# Mining decisions and the affected society – does science involvement can positively contribute to the process?

Mariana G. Lyra

Doctoral candidate, Environmental Policy, University of Eastern Finland

Mining activity involves opportunities and risks. These opportunities and risks (social, economic, environmental) provoke changes and add instability from planning to the post-closure phase. As the world seems to become increasingly interconnected, these instabilities cannot be seen isolated as local, national or global. We need to start seeing mining as a multi-level impact activity. This 'new' way to see it poses fundamental challenges in employing a more polycentric approach rather than focusing on one specific side of this intertwined system. A more decentralized approach towards community involvement in knowledge production and assessment in sustainability issues, for example, could improve collaboration through a more equalized empowerment. This transition process lead to novel spaces that overlap local knowledge with other kinds of knowledge, since it is becoming clearer that one stakeholder 'alone' is not able to address and solve complex issues we face now without inviting society to the table as well.

How to achieve a deeper understanding on how to cultivate spaces to bring more light on dialogues about the civic role in complex issues related to mining decisions that affects society?